

# GLOBAL PERSPECTIVES ON JAPAN

A Yearly Academic Journal

**Nº 6** 

2023

FORUM TAURI PRESS



### Scope

"Global Perspectives on Japan" focuses on developing a global perspective on the study of Japan and Asia. The journal promotes innovative, interdisciplinary, inter-regional and transnational approaches to Japanese Studies.

The journal aims to be a venue for scholarship in E.M.E.A. region with a special focus on Turkey and neighboring regions. It especially encourages scholars from the Middle East, Balkans, Central Asia and the Mediterranean but also welcomes scholars from other parts of the world.

GPJ invites papers in the fields of history, humanities, and social sciences including topics of the past and the present. In addition to articles, the journal publishes occasional article size translations, book reviews, and surveys of current trends in Japanese and Asian Studies.



#### GLOBAL PERSPECTIVES ON JAPAN (GPJ)

Publisher: FORUM TAURI Press Osmanağa Mah. Vişne Sk. No: 50, Kat 2, Kadıköy/ISTANBUL www.forumtauripress.com

Sponsored by: Toshiba International Foundation (TIFO) www.toshibafoundation.com



Partner Institution: Japanese Studies Association/Japonya Arastirmalari Dernegi (JAD) www.jad.org.tr



Editor-in-chief: Erdal K. Yalcin (Ph.D.) Assistant Editor: Jennifer Leigh Norris Design: Ergun Kocabıyık

ISSN: 2687-6132

#### **Editorial Board**

Ayşe Selçuk Esenbel (Em. Boğaziçi Üni.), Oğuz Baykara (Boğaziçi Uni.), Ali Akkemik (Yamaguchi Uni.), Altay Atlı (Sabancı Uni.), Ahmet Öncü (Boğaziçi Uni.)

#### National Board of Advisors (Alphabetical Order)

Murat Demircioğlu (Em.), Merthan Dündar (Ankara Uni.), Murat Dündar (Bahçeşehir Uni.),
Ali Volkan Erdemir (Erciyes Uni.), Hüseyin Can Erkin (Ankara Uni.),
Başak Koca Özer (Ankara Uni.), İsmail Özer (Ankara Uni.), Arzu Öztürkmen (Boğaziçi Uni.),
Ayşe Nur Tekmen (Ankara Uni.), İsenbike Togan (Em.), Mete Tuncoku (Em.),
Binnaz Toprak (Em.), Zafer Toprak (Boğaziçi Uni.)

#### International Board of Advisors (Alphabetical Order)

James Bartholomew (Em.), Sebastian Conrad (Freie Universität Berlin),
Carol Gluck (Columbia Uni.), Andrew Gordon (Harvard Uni.),
Kayoko Hayashi (Tokyo Uni. of Foreign Studies), Charles Horioka (Asian Growth Institute), Masaru
Ikei (Keio Uni.), Hisao Komatsu (Tokyo Uni. of Foreign Studies), Kaori Komatsu (Waseda Uni.),
Josef Kreiner (Em.), Hiroshi Mitani (Uni. of Tokyo), Li Narangoa (Australian National Uni.),
Ian Nish (Em.), Nakayama Noriko (Chubu Uni.), Sven Saaler (Teikyo Uni.),
Dominic Sachsenmeier (Georg-August-Universität Göttingen), Tsutomu Sakamoto (Em.),
Haruo Shirane (Columbia Uni.), Christopher Szpilman (Teikyo Uni.), Aoki Tamotsu (GRIPS),
Brij Tankha (Uni. Of Delhi), Suzuki Tadashi (Em.), Komori Yoichi (Uni. of Tokyo),
Shimizu Yuichiro (Keio Uni.)

GPJ is an OPEN ACCESS Journal allowing the readers download, copy, distribute, print, search, or link to the full texts of its articles and to use them for any other lawful purpose. For more information: The Budapest Open Access Initiative

#### Licencing Information

The articles in this journal are licensed under Creative common "Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International" (CC BY-SA 4.0)

The journal allow the author(s) to hold the copyright without restrictions and to retain publishing rights without restrictions.



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License.

# GLOBAL PERSPECTIVES ON JAPAN No. 6



# **Table of Contents**

Editor's Note	
Erdal K. Yalcin	9
Abstracts	13
Articles	
Narrative Development across Cultural and Historical Contexts: A Case Study of the Asian Versions of <i>The Homecoming Husband</i>	
Saida Khalmirzaeva	19
Japanese Sōtō Zen Monastery as a Worldly Institution	
Merve Susuz Aygül	38
Strengthening Germany-Japan Security Cooperation: An Examination of the Trends, Reasons, and Challenges	
Weijing Xing	70
An Elite Analysis: Reimagining LDP's Factions, 1955-1993  Yalın Akçevin	100
Selected Abbreviated Translations	
International Comparison of Constitutional Reform Processes In Terms of The Requirements of Indirect And Direct Democracy	
Takashi Kitamura	125
The Image of "the State" Seen in Japanese Historical Novels: From Nation-state to a New Public Order Like The EU	
Inoue Noriyuki	157

Current Status and Issues of Basic Education Guarantee	
in Japan under the Corona Crisis	
Makiko Shinya, Yohei Tanada	1
Cognitive Linguistics and Japanese-Language Education: How to deal with cross-cultural conflict?	
Michiyo Moriya	1
From The Perspective of Language Simplification Easy Japanese and Sign Language News	
Matsumoto Miho	7
Constitutional Amendment Debates in Japan Translated Abstracts of Selected Recent Japanese Literature	
Public Opinion on Constitutional Amendment in Postwar Japan: An Analysis of a "Pooling the Polls" Method	
Hirofumi Miwa, Shiro Sakaiya21	7
A Study on the Civilian Control concerning the Constitution of Japan, Article 66 <sup>th</sup> Paragraph 2	
Isaku Shibata 21	7
Democracy and Constitutional Amendment regarding the Constitution of Japan	
Ryosuke Yamada	8
The Process of Making "Draft of Constitutional Revisions by Hisatada HIROSE": The Note of Arguments About Constitutional Revisions	
Keisuke Arakuni	9
On Liberal Democratic Party's Draft Revision of Japanese Constitution	
Shigeaki Iijima	0

Problems of the Bill for a Referendum	
on the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan	
Shigeaki İijima	221
Memorandum on the Referendum Law for the Constitutional Amendments: From the Perspective of the People's Freedom of Speech on the Right to Know	
Hiroyuki Ota	223
The Making of the Amendment Clause in the Japanese Constitution of Japan - Formation on Process of the MacArthur Draft and its Background	
Masatoshi Takahashi	224
Significance of Unwritten Constitution in England and Japan: As Help of Consideration of the Problem of Amendment to the Japanese Constitution	
Yoshimine Komori	226
Comments on the Chapter 1 "The Emperor" of the Draft for the Amandmend of the Constitution of Japan by the Liberal Democratic Party of Japan: In Contrast to the Current Constitution	
Toru Enoki	227
A Short Bibliography on Recent Scholarship	
Hiroto Naiki	229
Book Review: Late Ottoman Istanbul Theater from a Japanese Perspective by Yuzo Nagata and Hikari Egawa	
Selçuk Esenbel	237

# **CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT DEBATES IN JAPAN**

Translated Abstracts of Selected Recent Japanese Literature

# Public Opinion on Constitutional Amendment in Postwar Japan: An Analysis of a "Pooling the Polls" Method<sup>1</sup>

Hirofumi Miwa, Shiro Sakaiya

The purpose of this study is to track the changes in the post-war constitutional awareness of the Japanese public by comprehensively analyzing the results of opinion polls on the constitution conducted by 7 major post-war research organizations. By using a "pooling the polls" method that applies a dynamic linear model, it is possible to estimate the potential support/opposition rate for the constitutional amendment after taking into account the differences in question content and wording, the trends for each research organization and research methods, and sampling errors. From the estimation results, it can be seen that in the 1950s, according to the perception of voters, constitutional amendment meant a total revision of the Constitution, while in the 1960s-80s, the issue converged on the revision of Article 9, and that in the 1990s and 2000s, voters became clearly aware of issues other than Article 9, and after the Koizumi administration, the focus was once again narrowing down to Article 9 issue. Furthermore, the results of the analysis of the question content and wording suggest that the revision of Article 9 is generally perceived by voters as the revision of paragraph 2 (of Article 9) only, and that association with war increases the rate of opposition to the revision of Article 9.



# A Study on the Civilian Control concerning the Constitution of Japan, $Article\, 66^{th}\, Paragraph\, 2^2$

#### Isaku Shibata

Even on a global scale, the Self-Defense Forces have become a modern and large-scale military force. Immediately after World War II, the Constitution of Japan renounced war in Article 9, and the concept of "civilians" was listed in Article 66, which put the "civilians" in charge of the administration of

<sup>1 『</sup>戦後日本人の憲法意識―世論調査集積法による分析』<u>https://doi.org/10.7218/nenpouseijiga-ku.71.1 34</u> Translated by Emel Salkı.

<sup>2 『</sup>シビリアン・コントロールに関する一考察: 日本国憲法第66 条第2項に関連して』<a href="https://opac.ll.chi-ba-u.jp/da/curator/107966/">https://opac.ll.chi-ba-u.jp/da/curator/107966/</a> Translated by Emel Salkı.

the Constitution of Japan. When Japan shifts its policy toward the active exercise of the right of collective self-defense, what would "civilians" mean, corresponding to the current state of Japan? Taking into account the meaning at the time of the enactment of the Constitution of Japan and the significance of "civilian control" (control of the armed forces by the civilian population; the same shall apply hereinafter) in other countries, this paper clarifies the meaning of "civilians" in light of (draft of) the amendment of the Constitution of Japan, which will follow the development of the security related laws.



# Democracy and Constitutional Amendment regarding the Constitution of Japan<sup>3</sup>

Ryosuke Yamada

(A Short Summary)

This paper discusses the meaning of democracy and how it relates to constitutional studies. First, it is important to understand that the concept of democracy is ambiguous and has different meanings depending on one's perspective. Second, from a constitutional perspective, democracy is important because it guarantees people's freedoms and rights. However, it is important to keep in mind the paradoxical nature of democracy, namely, the fact that democratic power necessarily involves a minority with organized coercion. Finally, this report argues that democracy is defined in the Constitution of Japan and should be practiced in a manner that protects the freedoms and rights of the people.

The report will examine how democracy has been enshrined and institutionalized in the Constitution of Japan and will touch upon the recent debate on constitutional reform, particularly the amendment of the Constitutional Amendment Clause. I would also like to examine the significance and challenges of constitutional reform from the perspectives of the "democratic process" and "realization of constitutional values".

A more democratic revision of the Constitution, both In terms of content

<sup>3 『</sup>日本国憲法におけるデモクラシーと憲法改正』 <a href="http://id.nii.ac.jp/1410/00015261/">http://id.nii.ac.jp/1410/00015261/</a> Summarized by Emel Salkı.

and procedure, will be achieved by diluting the confrontational political ideology of "constitutional revision versus constitutional protection", and developing a new approach that looks at other issues besides Article 9. In order to realize this, each citizen must have a sense of ownership of national elections and constitutional reform as their own problem and in that way, the Constitution can be revised not simply by the majority, but by the will of the entire nation, including the opinions of minority groups, in other words, by returning to the original principles of democracy.



# The Process of Making "Draft of Constitutional Revisions by Hisatada HIROSE": The Note of Arguments About Constitutional Revisions<sup>4</sup>

Keisuke Arakuni

### (A Short Summary)

Inspired by the NHK program named "The Constitution and the Japanese: 1949-64, the Unknown Offence and Defence" that featured part of the process of drafting the Constitutional Revision Draft (hereinafter referred to as the "Hirose Tentative Draft") published in 1957 by Hisatada Hirose, this paper will summarize part of the process of preparing the "Hirose Proposal" based on various documents in "Documents Related to Tatsuo Sato", and will then discuss some of the contents of the "Hirose Proposal".

It is fair to say that the framework of the constitutional revision proposal that later became the "Hirose Tentative Plan" had long been formulated in Hirose's mind. First, the process that led to the completion of the "Hirose Draft", a possible "prototype" and the people who were involved in its creation are traced. Most of the ideas about constitutional revision that appear in "Document for Free Discussion on the Issue of Constitutional Revision (Hirose Draft) " dated August 5, 1955, are reflected in the "Hirose Tentative Draft," although there are some differences, it is safe to say that this is the "prototype" of the "Hirose Draft" of 1957.

According to various documents in the "Sato Tatsuo Documents," the

<sup>4 『「</sup>広瀬試案」の作成過程― 戦後憲法改正論議についての覚書 ―』 <a href="https://doi.org/10.24703/taka-hogaku.37.0">https://doi.org/10.24703/taka-hogaku.37.0</a> 」 Summarized by Emel Salkı.

"Hirose Draft," was at least completed through consideration and revision of the following drafts: (I) "Proposed Amendments to the Constitution of Japan" dated April 28, 1956 ("Initial Draft"), (ii) "Tentative Draft for Revision of the Constitution of Japan" dated August 25, 1956 ("First Amendment" draft), (iii) "Tentative Draft for Revision of the Constitution of Japan" dated October 31, 1956 ("Revised Version"). Lastly, the discussed contents of the "Hirose Proposal" are its provisions on the supreme command authority of the military, therefore the evaluation of the "Hirose Draft" as a whole cannot be based on this paper.



# On Liberal Democratic Party's Draft Revision of Japanese Constitution<sup>5</sup> Shigeaki Iijima

(A Short Summary)

On April 27, 2012, the Liberal Democratic Party (LDP), which has made the enactment of an independent constitution its party policy since its formation, prepared the "Draft for Revision of the Constitution of Japan" (hereinafter referred to as the LDP "Constitution Draft"). As a constitutional scholar, I feel it is my social responsibility to present what kind of changes the LDP "Constitutional Revision Draft" may bring about in Japanese society.

In this paper, I would like to outline the LDP "Draft Constitution" and its problems and present them to the sovereign citizens of Japan. It is not possible to discuss all the issues in this paper, therefore I would like to focus on the issues surrounding the creation of a "national defense force," which were widely covered in the media before the House of Representatives election in December 2012.

If the National Defense Force is created, there is a possibility that doctors, nurses, construction workers, civil engineers, seamen, and people engaged in the transportation industry will be sent to the battlefield. If the Constitution,

<sup>5 『</sup>自民党「日本国憲法改正草案」について』<u>http://doi.org/10.15012/00000154</u> Summarized by Emel Salkı.

which is the basis of national politics, is revised, it is highly likely that the state of the nation and people's lives will change. The problem is defined as "Japan turning into a country capable of waging war even overseas". The missions of the National Defense Forces are examined one by one and the possible effects and issues are presented and discussed further throughout Chapter 3. Finally in Chapter 4, how sovereigns should respond to the change of the Constitution of Japan is explained in the light of three titles: (1) Why change the Constitution of Japan? (2) What do you think of the Liberal Democratic Party's "Constitutional Revision Draft, (3) Referendum on Constitutional Reform.



# Problems of the Bill for a Referendum on the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan<sup>6</sup>

Shigeaki İijima

This article focuses on the problems of the bill for a referendum on the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan. This issue is of great importance to Japan's sovereignty and military independence throughout history. The paper first establishes the previous political developments, then explains the reasons and effects of related events through the use of examples, numbers, metaphors, data, and historical connections. On December 2, 1952, the Electoral System Investigation Committee introduced and pushed for the idea by publishing guidelines in this respect and submitting outlines. However, this attempt only remained as an "intention" for over 50 years and was not executed due to concerns of misunderstandings and confusion. On November 16, 2001, the matter arose once more as the supporters of the constitutional revision became the overwhelming majority in the Parliament, thus, the "Bill for a Referendum on the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan" was announced. The government appealed to the Parliament, and the Democratic Party was also moderately supportive. As the amendment started to become a reality, it was urged that the amendment process be codified

<sup>6 『「</sup>日本国憲法の改正手続に関する法律案」の問題点』 <a href="http://doi.org/10.34360/00009758">http://doi.org/10.34360/00009758</a> Summarized by Dilara Nur Önelge.

in law. The article then delves into the details of the definitions, types, and distinctions of "constitution" and "constitutional amendment". Throughout the paper, the discussions are grounded on the aforementioned constitutional theory. Japan's constitution is one that focuses on guaranteeing individual rights, and it may limit state power to do so. Constitutions are to be stable, while the conditions of politics and economy are infinitely dynamic. Thus, there are fair grounds for amendments, as no constitution can choose not to respond to contemporary issues. The constitution of Japan stipulates that for an amendment, the votes of 2/3s or more of all members of each party and a majority vote in a national referendum are required. However, the problem rises as the people in charge are reluctant to amend the constitution in favour of waiving their current power. Furthermore, numerous historians and politicians are against referendums as people are infinitely easy to manipulate, and a competent question is enough to get the desired answer out of them. In brief, the referendum was seen as a desperate attempt, and the result of the parliament will inherently favour those in power. In addition to these problems, the outcome of the referendum may also be influenced by where the threshold for the necessary votes is set. Thus, the authorities once more have a window to exert power and manipulate results. Other examples of this include the prohibition of reporting any sided news or the exclusion of many citizens from the referendum campaign, which are unjustified restrictions of freedom of expression, making the situation anti-democratic. That the authorities denounced virtually all commentary on the issue, which led to the public not being able to discuss and debate on their own terms. In a country where the people cannot decide for the country, national sovereignty is inadequate. The article concludes that for a reliable and fair referendum, people need to be exposed to all information and form their own opinions freely. Potential dangers will always be present, but it is possible to diminish them when people are given the power and respect they need to determine their future.



### Memorandum on the Referendum Law for the Constitutional Amendments: From the Perspective of the People's Freedom of Speech and the Right to Know<sup>7</sup>

### Hiroyuki Ota

This article tackles the questions of how the majority approval in a referendum can be determined, and the procedures the National Assembly needs to follow to propose constitutional amendments. The instances in which there are multiple items in question entail the right to propose referendums, which, however, makes conducting the referendum much more difficult and complicated. There are numerous incentives for Japan to consider revising its constitution, almost all of which are grounded on reinforcing sovereignty and enabling independent armed forces. In the 1990s, Japan enacted the Peace Keeping Operation Cooperation Law and was expected to contribute to efforts on keeping the peace. The Gulf War gave rise to discussions about Japan's army being employed overseas, as it was named "Self-defense Forces". Thus, Japan's armed forces were renamed "Peace Keeping Security Forces" and were able to expand. In the 2000s, with the agreement of both houses of parliament, the Constitutional Research Commission was established. The report is filed after 5 years of research indicating that there is a virtual possibility of some revisions to the constitution in the not-too-distant future. The contention lies in the fact that the referendum is imperative for the amendment to be settled, however, the conditions for the referendum are not ideal or currently attainable. This paper focuses on the significance of freedom of expression and the right to know of sovereign citizens for the amendment and shows that freedom of the mass media is fundamental to ensure these. The amendment is the culmination of the exercise of sovereign power by the people of the country, however, it is not rendered fully possible due to the current constitution which adopts "representative democracy", which means people can only choose their representatives, and the representatives do the rest for them. In the referendum, each person will get to decide on their own, and for them to make the wisest decision, they need to have all the necessary information on public policy. It is continuously emphasized that people

<sup>7 『</sup>憲法改正国民投票法に関する覚書: 主権者の表現の自由・知る権利の観点から』 <u>http://doi.org/10.14988/pa.2017.0000007620</u> Summarized by Dilara Nur Önelge.

have the right to know and express themselves freely, and the media has the immunity to report on people's rights to inform them. Although, there have been applications to bar discussions or endorsements about the referendum, such as Article 43 which prohibits state officials from partaking in any explicit activity concerning the referendum. Along with the Constitutional Declaration that prohibits foreign nationals from speaking out about the constitutional amendment, it is safe to say that people are discouraged to teach or learn about the subject matter, and they are expected to cast their votes while insufficiently informed. The article delves into all kinds of details regarding the issue and refers to every law, act, article, and provision by number. It concludes that the impediment of sovereign people's freedom of speech and right to know under any circumstance is unacceptable, and especially on a matter of public interest such as the constitutional amendment, people need to be communicated all information and rendered able to express their opinions.



# The Making of the Amendment Clause in the Japanese Constitution –Formation Process of the MacArthur Draft and its Background–8

#### Masatoshi Takahashi

The fundamental concept of the amendment provisions of the Japanese Constitution was under the influence of the McCarthyist theory of constitutional revision. The manner in which the amendment provisions to the Constitution of Japan, including the theory of limits of the amendment, are interpreted in the circumstances of its origin is overwhelmingly in line with the process of formation undertaken by the draft lawmakers of the European countries. This paper focuses on the issue of restrictions to revisions. Modifications to the amendment were restricted from as early as the 6<sup>th</sup> of February, 1946, on which even the Emperor's authority was not sufficient for revisions, but needed to be in tandem with the executive committee. Thus, the power to execute constitutional amendments was exclusively limited

<sup>8 『</sup>日本国憲法改正規定の背景―マッカーサー草案における形成過程とその Background』 <a href="http://doi.org/10.57372/00003957">http://doi.org/10.57372/00003957</a> Summarized by Dilara Nur Önelge.

to the formal authority. From then on, a designated session to revise the constitution was held yearly in the Parliament. In the "Review Clause", it was stated that the constitution will not be amended for the next 10 years, i.e., until 1955. Then, the constitutional revision was proposed by the twothirds majority of the Parliament and approved by the three-fourths majority. The exceptional features of this provision are that it can be revised only by a special majority vote of the Parliament, and it includes a peculiar section where it presumes unusual circumstances for Japan, such as the prohibition period for revisions and periodic reconsideration. The reason for this is Article 24 of the first draft which stipulates that the Parliament is the only body empowered to amend the constitution. Furthermore, Article 5 states that the only duty of the Emperor is to affix an official seal and promulgate all constitutional revisions. In light of both of these articles, there is a clear intention to stop the Emperor's authority over the constitution. The Emperor's Committee argued that the Japanese people are not ready for the operation of democracy, but the Parliament did not risk losing their new constitution through revisions pushed for by the single will of the Emperor. Moreover, the requirement for a fairly high approval rate of two-thirds to three-quarters for proposals and ratifications of amendments suggests that actual changes to the constitution may not really be plausible, and the political whims of the majority may steer the results. Many objected to the prohibitions periods for revisions by asserting that one generation should not have the right to restrict the next generation's freedom to amend the constitution according to the needs and conditions of their time. The article delves into further detail on the grounds for making the amendments and the circumstances surrounding the framework and timeline.



# Significance of Unwritten Constitution in England and Japan: as Help of Consideration of the Problem of Amendment to the Japanese Constitution<sup>9</sup>

#### Yoshimine Komori

The concept of the English unwritten constitution could be a guiding help to Japan in the process of revising its constitution. The English unwritten constitution ensures the maintenance of old and good tradition and civilization, flexible correspondence to changing social circumstances, and stability of legal life by not calling an unconstitutionality in question. This is of great importance in the current case of Japan, in which discussions concerning the problem of amendments to the Constitution are terribly commonplace. Numerous drafts are proposed constantly. This paper argues for an unwritten constitution for Japan, as it would undoubtedly be the most suitable option for a country older than England such as Japan. Firstly, the general idea of an unwritten constitution is explained in detail, then the sources and merits of current unwritten constitutions are demonstrated, the significance of this type of constitution for Japan is put into perspective, and finally, a comparative study of the Magna Carta of England and the 17 Articles Constitution of Japan is illustrated. A constitution is essential, in the abstract sense, a set of conventions and practices that define the relationship between the State, various national institutions, and all the citizens. It usually exists as a single legal code, enacted in a form, and establishes the basic operating principles of the jury. Written or unwritten, all constitutions conform to this meaning and fulfill the obligations that arise from the definition. There are historical similarities between England, a country with an unwritten constitution, and Japan. For instance, England has a Superior Court, which is absolutely binding on all other courts and is likewise definitely nonobedient. The bodies to exercise their judicial power were elected through an elaborate process and met intricate criteria: they needed to be permanent aristocrats over the age of 75, be within the House of Lords, and be chosen by the advice of the Queen or the Prime Minister. At the same time, Japan's

<sup>9 『</sup>日英両国における不文憲法の重要性: 日本国憲法改正問題考察の一助として』 <a href="https://doi.org/10.20691/houseiken.10.0">https://doi.org/10.20691/houseiken.10.0</a> 17 Summarized by Dilara Nur Önelge.

highest administrative organ was operating very alike, it was named the House of Peers, and its chairmen would be one of the nobles of the House. Other similar ways of operation include the first instance of Civil Law and the Court of Appeal in both countries. The strength and culture of the unwritten constitution of England manifest through many aspects, such as the solidarity between the House of Commons and House of Lords, practices of Morality through decree, and the successful evasion of political setbacks. Furthermore, the more rigid the law, the more difficult it is to revise. Thus, an unwritten constitution is flexible and can be modified more quickly to meet the needs of the changing times. It responds to the people whom it serves. It contributes to the stability of the legal and political life of the citizens. The potency and prosperity of the unwritten constitution are obvious to understand; England was the first and only country to adopt it in the 13th century, long before other nations started to configure their own laws in the 17th century, and England's constitution is the one in auspicious use.



## Comments on the Chapter I "The Emperor" of the Draft for the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan by the Liberal Democratic Party of Japan: In Contrast to the Current Constitution<sup>10</sup>

#### Tōru Enoki

This paper presents a discussion of the current Constitution of Japan and the Liberal Democratic Party's (LDP) draft revision through a comparison of the notion of "Emperor". The interpretation of the imperial system by both sides is provided and clarified comprehensively. Japan has been governed by the sovereignty of its people, based on the separation of the three branches of power: executive, legislative, and judicial. The government of Japan is established by the trust of the citizens from whom its authority is derived. It is emphasized that the foundations of the current constitution are the universal principles of humanity. However, LDP introduces a new notion of regulation

<sup>10 『</sup>自由民主党日本国憲法改正草案 第1章「天皇」評注: 日本国憲法との比較検討』 <a href="http://doi.org/10.34360/00004705">http://doi.org/10.34360/00004705</a> Summarized by Dilara Nur Önelge.

based on the theory of innate human rights. They created the draft with the purpose of a new constitution on par with Japan's ideals. They argue that the current constitution does not mention respect for fundamental human rights. Its definition of state does not coincide with constitutionalism, in which the state protects or serves the people. The problems with the current constitution are that it is outdated, and is grounded on ambiguous ideas such as history and culture. It refers to the Emperor, who is but a symbol, as being superior to the people. When Japan adopted the Constitution of Japan, the imperial system ceased to exist, however, the "Emperor" remained as a symbol in the Constitution. The reason why is that Japan acted in line with the theory of continuity, which means the Emperor has no power over the Constitution, but has the authority to act on matters not prohibited by the Constitution. Some claim that the notion of "Emperor" is to be interpreted declaratively, he is not granted powers or roles, he is but a symbol of the State. The other line of thought is named the rupture theory, which urges for complete severance from the Emperor. The Emperor should not be able to operate outside of matters over which the Constitution does not grant him explicit authority. In LDP's draft, the Emperor is retained as a symbol of State and unity but is not specified as Head of State. Thus, it is reinforced that the people and the law are sovereign, and there is no power above them. Whereas the current constitution refers to the Emperor as a crowned being and is open to interpretations that consider him the sovereign Head of State. Other issues include the absence of the national anthem and flag in the current constitution, and there being a separate law concerning the two. The LDP's draft advocates for the national anthem and flag to be provided in the Constitution as they are the true symbol of the sovereignty and freedom of a country, which all the people respect and internalize. In conclusion, the LDP's draft focuses on subjects pertaining to the rights and sovereignty of citizens, and restricting the authority given to the Emperor.

# A Short Bibliography on Recent Scholarship

AUTHOR	YEAR	PUBLICATION
ABE, Ikuo	2022	国連改革と日本国憲法改正は急務 (Emergency of Reform of United Nations and Amendments of the Constitution of Japan), Japan, vol. 72(6), pp. 9-12.
AIKYO, Koji	2022	自民党「日本国憲法改正草案」と現在の改憲論 議 (Liberal Democratic Party "Newly-proposed Amendment to the Constitution of Japan" and the Current Argument about the Revision of the Constitution of Japan), Inhabitant and Autonomy, vol. 709, pp. 10-14.
AIKYO, Koji	2013	自民党「日本国憲法改正草案」の問題点:「安倍改憲」 はなぜ危険か (The Problem of the Draft Constitution by the Liberal Democratic Party: The risk of "Abe Amendment"), National medicine, vol. 307, pp. 2-9.
AIKYO, Koji	2013	自民党「日本国憲法改正草案」のどこが問題か (The Problem of the Draft Constitution of Japan by the Liberal Democratic Party), World, vol. 840, pp. 128- 136.
AKASAKA, Koichi	2014	初期日本国憲法改正論議資料(The Data of the Early Argument of the amendment to the Constitution of Japan), Tokyo, Kashiwa Books
AKASAKA, Koichi	2014	初期日本国憲法改正論議資料:萍憲法研究会速記録(参議院所蔵) 1953-59 (The Data of the Early Argument of the Amendment to the Constitution of Japan: The Record of the Ukikusa Constitutional Institution from 1953 to 1959), Tokyo, Kashiwa Books.
AONO,Atsushi	2012	自民党「日本国憲法改正草案」について (Analyzing the Liberal Democratic Party's Draft Revision of the Constitution of Japan), Readings in Economics of Oita University, vol. 64(3-4), pp. 123-158.

	1	
ARAKUNI, Keisuke	2019	広瀬試案」の作成過程: 戦後憲法改正論議についての 覚書 (The Process of Making "Draft of Constitutional Revisions by Hisatada HIROSE": The Note of Arguments about Constitutional Revisions), Takaoka law review, vol. 37, pp. 1-32
ENOKI, Toru	2016	自由民主党日本国憲法改正草案第1章「天皇」評注:日本国憲法との比較検討 (Comments on the Chapter I "The Emperor" of the Draft for the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan by the Liberal Democratic Party of Japan: In Contrast to the Current Constitution), Senshu law journal, vol. 12, pp. 181-208.
HOZUMI, Masashi	2014	自民党「日本国憲法改正草案」にどう向き合うか(How to Deal With the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan by the Liberal Democratic Party), Federation of Home Economics Education Researchers, vol. 318, pp. 4-9.
IJIMA, Shigeaki	2013	平和主義から考える自民党「日本国憲法改正草案」の問題点(The Problem of the Draft Constitution by the Liberal Democratic Party in Terms of Pacifism), Law and Democracy, vol. 479, pp. 20-24
IJIMA, Shigeaki	2013	自民党「日本国憲法改正草案」について (The Draft for the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan by the Liberal Democratic Party), Journal of Nagoya Gakuin University. Social sciences, vol. 49, pp. 41-66.
IMAI, Hisao	2014	政界古参記者風雲録(121)日本国憲法改正に突撃せよ (Tackle the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan), Current Monthly, vol. 51(10), pp. 28-31.
ITO, Makoto	2013	自由民主党「日本国憲法改正草案」を考える (Consider the Draft Constitution by the Liberal Democratic Party), History and Geography Education, vol. 804, pp. 58-65.
IWASA, Hideo	2013	徹底検証 自民党日本国憲法改正草案 いま、求められているのは、「憲法を変えること」ではなく、「憲法を活かし、広げること」 (The Draft Constitution of Japan by the Liberal Democratic Party: What Is Needed Now Now Is to Utilize and Expand the Constitution, Not to Amend), Women and Campaign, vol. 218, pp. 2-7.
KANEKO, Masaru	2018	自民党「日本国憲法改正草案」をきる (Liberal Democratic Party: Criticize "The Draft of the Amendment to the Constitution of Japan"), Tokyo, Honnoizumi Co.

KANEKO, Masaru	2014	「民主憲法」から「ファシズム憲法」へ: 自由民主党「 日本国憲法改正草案」の本質 (From the Democratic Constitution to the Fascistic Constitution), The Rissyo Law View, vol, 47(2), pp. 149-182.
KANEKO, Masaru	2013	「平和憲法」から「『安保』憲法」へ:自由民主党「日本国憲法改正草案」の本質 (From the Peace Constitution to That Based on the Regime of the Japan-U.S. Security Treaty), The Rissho law review, vol. 47(1), pp. 59-86.
KAWAMURA, Toshio	2012	憲法「改正」にむけた重大な動き: 自民党の「日本国憲法改正草案」を中心に (Significant Moves toward Constitutional "Revision": Focusing on "The Draft for Revision of the Constitution of Japan" by the Liberal Democratic Party), Women and Movement, vol. 358, pp. 26-29.
KITAMURA, Sayo	2012	季節風 障害者差別禁止を謳う「自民党 日本国憲法改正草案」に、障害者はだまされるな (The Monsoon Claim the Prohibition of Discrimination to People with Disability, They Should Not Be Deceived "The Draft of the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan"), Welfare and Labor, vol. 137, pp. 137-141.
KITAMURA, Takashi	2014	憲法改正手続の国際比較: 間接民主制及び直接民主制の要件の観点から (International Comparison of Constitutional Amendment Procedures: From the Viewpoint of Requirements for Indirect and Direct Democracy), The Japanese journal of law and political science, vol. 51, pp. 161-181.
KOBAYASHI, Setsu	2017	白熱講義!憲法改正 : 決定版 (A Definitive Edition: Heated Lecture of Constitutional Reform), Tokyo, Bestsellers.
KOBAYASHI, Setsu	2015	憲法改正の覚悟はあるか: 主権者のための日本国憲法 改正特別講座 (Are You Ready for the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan: Special Lessons for sovereigns), Tokyo, Best Sellers.
KOBAYASHI, Setsu	2013	白熱講義!日本国憲法改正 (A Lecture of Constitutional Reform), Tokyo, Bestsellers.
KOCHI, Otoya	2013	日本型ネオ・ファシズムの大典: 安倍自民党の「日本国憲法改正草案」(The Draft of the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan by the Liberal Democratic Party of Abe: Neo Nazism of Japan), The Communist, vol. 264, pp. 170-183.

LUMMIS, C Douglad	2015	コミュニケーション論から見た日本国憲法と自民党の「日本国憲法改正草案」(Constitution of Japan and the Draft for the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan by the Liberal Democratic Party of Japan in Terms of the Theories of Communication), Japanese journal of communication studies, vol. 43(2), pp. 81-87.
MARK,Craig	2014	Japanese Constitutional Change and the Trilateral Security Dialogue, Journal of international studies, vol. 3(1), pp. 45-47
MIWA, Hirohumi and SAKAIYA, Shiro	2020	戦後日本人の憲法意識: 世論調査集積法による分析 (Public Opinion on Constitutional Revision in Postwar Japan: An Application of a "Pooling the Polls" Method), The annuals of Japanese Political Science Association, vol. 2020(1), pp. 34-57.
MIZUBAYASHI, Takeshi	2017	自民党『日本国憲法改正草案』の歴史的性格: 江戸期法 度支配の再現 (Liberal Democratic Party's Historical Characters: Recrate of the Reign of Law), General Research Institute of Matsuyama University, vol. 98, pp. 5-13.
MOTO, Ryuichi	2015	最近の主な日本国憲法改正提言: 平成25年1月~平成26年12月及び補遺 (Suggestions about the Amendment to the Constitution of Japan: Addendum from January of Hesei 25th to December of Hesei 26th), Issue brief, vol. 856, pp. 1-14.
NAKAGAWA, Syuichi	2022	日本国憲法改正論点について: 特に憲法の「語」について(3)(The Point of Arguments of the Amendment to the Constitution of Japan: Especially about the "Words" of the Constitution 3), Law review of North Asia University, vol. 63, pp. 39-72.
NAKAGAWA, Syuichi	2021	日本国憲法改正論点について: 特に憲法の「語」について(2)(The Point of Arguments of the Amendment to the Constitution of Japan: Especially about the "Words" of the Constitution 2), Law review of North Asia University, vol. 62, pp. 19-46.
NAKAGAWA, Syuichi	2020	日本国憲法改正論点について: 特に憲法の「語」について(1)(The Point of Arguments of the Amendment to the Constitution of Japan: Especially about the "Words" of the Constitution 1), Law review of North Asia University, vol. 61, pp. 1-24.

NAKAJIMA, Osamu	2013	なしくずし改憲の集約として明文改憲ねらう: 自民党の「日本国憲法改正草案」を読んで (Aim to Amend the Text of Constitution of Japan at the End of Continuing Constitutional Amendment: From the Draft of the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan by the Liberal Democratic Party), Socialism, vol. 611, pp. 68-75.
NAKAMASA, Masaki	2013	ハイエクから見る日本国憲法改正議論 憲法は国民の共通の信念を反映するもの (The Argument of the Amendment of Constitution of Japan from the Point of Hayek: Constitution Reflect Is a Common Brief of Nation), Friday, vol. 21(31), pp. 42-45.
NAKANO, AMi	2016	自民党「日本国憲法改正草案」を読み解く (Analyze the Draft for the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan by the Liberal Democratic Party of Japan), Women's Asia, vol. 86, pp. 10-14.
NARISAWA, Takato	2018	ブレグジットと日本国憲法改正 (Brexit and Amendments to the Constitution of Japan), Law and Democracy, vol. 527, pp. 34-39.
NONOMURA, Keiko	2014	どう読みますか 自由民主党「日本国憲法改正草案」: 2012年4月27日決定(第6回)第三章 国民の権利と義務 (その2)私の憲法観(How Do You Interpret the Draft of Amendment of the Constitution of Japan by the Liberal Democratic Party < Sixth Meeting, Definitive Edition on April 27th, 2012>: Chapter3. Rights and Duties of the People No.2: My Point of View of Constitution), Social Education Monthly, vol. 58(4), pp. 66-70.
NONOMURA, Keiko	2014	どう読みますか 自由民主党「日本国憲法改正草案」: 2012年4月27日決定(第5回)第三章 国民の権利と義務(その1)(How Do You Interpret the Draft of the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan by the Liberal Democratic Party < The Fifth Definitive Edition on April 27th, 2012 >: Chapter 3. Rights and Duties of the People No.1), Social Education Monthly, vol. 58(3), pp. 62-66.

NONOMURA, Keiko	2014	どう読みますか 自由民主党「日本国憲法改正草案」: 2012年4月27日決定(第4回)第二章 現行「戦争の放棄」と草案「安全保障」及び草案第九章「緊急事態」(How Do You Interpret the Draft of the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan by the Liberal Democratic Party <the 27th,2012="" april="" definitive="" edition="" forth="" on="">: Chapter 2. "Renunciation of War" and the Draft of "Security", Chapter 9. The Draft of "Emergency"), Social Education Monthly, vol. 58(2), pp. 69-73.</the>
NONOMURA, Keiko	2014	どう読みますか 自由民主党「日本国憲法改正草案」: 2012年4月27日決定(第3回)第一章 天皇(How Do You Interpret the Draft of the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan by the Liberal Democratic Party <the april<br="" definitive="" edition="" on="" third="">27th,2012&gt;: Chapter 1. The Emperor), Social Education Monthly, vol. 58(1), pp. 58-61.</the>
NONOMURA, Keiko	2013	どう読みますか? 自由民主党「日本国憲法改正草案」: 2012年4月27日決定(第2回)前文(How Do You Interpret the Draft of the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan by the Liberal Democratic Party <the 27th,2012="" april="" definitive="" edition="" on="" second="">: Preamble), Social Education Monthly, vol. 57(12), pp. 62-65.</the>
NONOMURA, Keiko	2013	どう読みますか? 自由民主党「日本国憲法改正草案」: 2012年4月27日決定(How Do You Interpret the Draft of the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan by the Liberal Democratic Party < The First Definitive Edition on April 27th,2012>: Preamble), Social Education Monthly, vol. 57(9), pp. 66-69.
OBATA, Takayoshi	2013	自民党の憲法構想:「日本国憲法改正草案」の検討 (Constitution Concept of the Liberal Democratic Party: Considering the Draft of the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan), The Memory of Okayama, vol. 15, pp. 6-17.
ODAWARA, Syogen	2017	「悪党」の世直し論(其の165)日本国憲法改正の裏にある課題 (Social Reform by Blackguard No.165: Issues behind the Amendment to the Constitution of Japan), Jihyo, vol. 59(12), pp. 92-96.

OKUDAIRA, Hiroyasu et al., EJIMA, Akiko	2013	改憲の何が問題か,「問題は、人権規定なのか、人権を実現する仕組み(統治機構)なのか一「日本国憲法改正草案」を国際人権条約・比較憲法から見る」(The Problem of Constitutional Amendment: Is the Problem a Human Rights Regulation or a Mechanism (Governance Organization) to Realize Human Rights? – Looking at "The Draft Amendment to the Constitution of Japan" from the Perspective of International Human Rights Treaties and Comparative Constitutions), Tokyo, Iwanami Books.
SAKAGUCHI, Syojiro	2013	講演録 自民党の日本国憲法改正草案について考える (Manuscript Speech Considering the Draft Constitution by the Liberal Democratic Party), A Study of a Cooperative Society, vol. 454, pp. 49-56.
SAKAGUCHI, Syojiro	2013	自民党の日本国憲法改正草案について考える (Considering the Draft Constitution by the Liberal Democratic Party), A Study of a Cooperative Society, vol. 454, pp. 49-56.
SHIBATA, Isaku	2020	シビリアン・コントロールに関する一考察: 日本国憲法 第66 条第2項に関連して (A Study on the Civilian Control concerning the Constitution of Japan, Article 66th), Journal of Studies on Humanities and Public Affairs of Chiba University, vol. 40, pp. 130-145.
SHINGAE, Akitomo	2017	自民党「日本国憲法改正草案」とセクシュアルマイノリティ (Liberal Democratic Party's Constitutional Reform Draft and Sexual Minorities in Japan), Journal of Japanese scientists, vol. 52(7), pp. 368-373.
SUAMI, Takao	2013	多元的憲法秩序における憲法改正一EUと日本 国憲法改正 (The Amendment in the Pluralistic Constitutional Order: European Union and the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan), The Extra Edition of Legal Bulletin, The Extra Edition, pp. 49-53.
SUZUKI, Takahiro	2013	最近の主な日本国憲法改正提言: 平成17年12月~平成24年12月 (Suggestions about the Amendment to the Constitution of Japan: December of Hesei 17 <sup>th</sup> to December of Hesei 24 <sup>th</sup> ), Issue brief, vol. 774, pp. 1-15.

TAKITA, Yasunari	2013	自由民主党 日本国憲法改正草案を検証する憲法が変わるとき、表現の自由の形が変えられる (Inspect the Draft of the Amendment of the Constitution of Japan by the Liberal Democratic Party: Freedom of Expression Is Changed When the Constitution Changes), Japanese publications news and reviews, vol. 2300, pp. 4-9.
USUBA, Mie	2014	2014年 これまでの日本・これからの日本 続・「日本国憲法改正」と「地球儀を俯瞰する外交」 (The past and future of Japan "The Amendment for the Constitution of Japan" and "Diplomacy to overlook the globe"), Current Monthly, vol. 51(7), pp. 48-51.
USUBA, Mie	2014	2014年 これまでの日本・これからの日本 続・「日本 国憲法改正」と「地球儀を俯瞰する外交」: 軍事と平 和という国益について考える国民投票について (The Past and Future of Japan "The Amendment for the Constitution of Japan" and "Diplomacy to Overlook the Globe": National Referendum Thinking about the National Interests, Military Affairs and Peace), Current Monthly, vol. 51(6), pp. 58-62.
WATANABE, Hisamaru	2012	自民党日本国憲法改正草案(12·4·27) は歴史逆 行 (The Liberal Democratic Party's Draft Revision of the Constitution of Japan "April 4th, 2012" Runs Counter to the Actual Historical Development), Peace Movement, vol. 497, pp. 12-19.
WATANABE, Osamu	2022	日本国憲法「改正」史: 憲法をめぐる戦後史・その1 (The History of "Amendments" of the Constitution of Japan: Postwar History about Constitution No. 1), Tokyo, Kuro Co.
YAMADA, Ryosuke	2021	日本国憲法におけるデモクラシーと憲法改正 (Democracy and Constitutional Reform in the Constitution of Japan), Kokushikan University Political Studies, vol. 12, pp. 177-192.
YONEZAWA, Tatsuji	2013	時潮 自由民主党「日本国憲法改正草案」の批判的検討(Current Affairs Commentary: Critical Consideration to the Draft Constitution of Japan by the Liberal Democratic Party), National Institution of Tax and Accounting, vol. 611, pp. 1-3.
YUKI, Yoichiro	2013	自由民主党「日本国憲法改正草案」の問題点(The Problem of the Draft Constitution by the Liberal Democratic Party), The Institution of municipality of Hokkaido, vol. 534, pp. 2-9.

### **BOOK REVIEW**

Yuzo Nagata and Hikari Egawa. *Bir Kentin Toplumsal Tarihi Açısından Osmanlı'nın Son Döneminde İstanbul'da Tiyatro ve Çevresi* (Late Ottoman Istanbul Theater from a Japanese Perspective). (İstanbul: Dergah Yayınları, 2021).

## Selçuk Esenbel

This review focuses on the late nineteenth-century interaction between European theater forms and content with traditional and Western-style Turkish drama practices in Ottoman Istanbul from a novel Japanese perspective. The paper will start with an expose of the topic through the recent publication of Yūzō Nagata and Hikari Egawa on the Theater and its Circle in late Ottoman Istanbul from the perspective of the social history of a city.

The study of Nagata and Egawa is based on a rich collection of more than 170 nineteenth-century play posters and archival materials of the Ottoman Istanbul theater world that Nagata collected while he was a student and doing research in the Ottoman archives back in the 1960s when he used to stroll in the old book stores of the city that have unfortunately waned away to this date. The collection became the foundation of an important study that develops a complex comparative analysis of the divergent attitudes that traditional Turkish theater and traditional Kabuki of Japan showed toward Westernization. The topic of Late Ottoman Istanbul Theater from a Japanese Perspective, thus, reveals the mobility and transformation of European culture in different geographic and social settings as part of the "civilizing process" of reforms for the sake of "modernizing" these societies. The Euro-Turkish or Euro-Japanese interaction in the example of theater culture surfaces as local encounters of transfers that represent the globally dynamic

history of westernization beyond Europe in distinct patterns that need further investigation. The history of European theater's encounters between Istanbul and Tokyo resulted in multiple combinations of the local with the West, but also exhibited a distinct pattern of two theaters namely the Western-based mode of dramatic theater and the co-eval transformation of the local earlier traditional forms by using Western components into a new form of theater.

The Nagata Yūzō and Hikari Egawa's book on Late Ottoman Istanbul Theater and its Circle from the Perspective of the Social History of a City which was published in Turkish by Dergah Yayinlari in 2021 offers rich information on the theater culture of the city derived mostly from Professor Nagata Yūzō's remarkable personal collection of theater posters and pamphlets. The rich Nagata poster collection gives us details on the European-style plays that were performed in the downtown area of Pera, the cosmopolitan center of the capital, and the improvised performances and entertainment shows considered as more Turkish forms of popular performance of a new theater district in the old city known as Direkler Arası Şehzadebaşı neighborhood that is close to today's Istanbul University. The gardens on the Anatolian side of the city also became sites for more local "Turkish" forms of entertainment.

The posters provide information on the performers, the plots, the advertisement of sponsoring businesses, and even the addresses of restaurants that served the lively theater crowds. The posters form the primary source of the book showing Istanbul as the urban setting of a very dynamic theater world that benefited from the entry of European culture and Europeans themselves as well as the transformation of the existing traditional troupes that performed the local "Middle Play", open-air entertainment performances into new genres of performance.

Nagata Yūzō and Hikari Egawa the two authors of the book who expose a novel Japanese perspective on the modern cultural history of Istanbul are both scholars of Ottoman history who have expertise in applying a comparative approach to Ottoman historical transformation with that of early modern Japan of the feudal era under the Tokugawa Shogunate 1600-1867 and the making of modern Japan under the Meiji Restoration period between 1868-1912 which also experienced the strong influence of European culture as part of Japan's modernization process.

Having received his Ph.D. from Istanbul University like many Japanese

scholars of Ottoman history who prefer to study the subject in Turkey where they get better linguistic training and familiarity with the archives rather than in the United States or Europe, Nagata is an eminent social historian of the 18th century late Ottoman period with a long career in Meiji University and Tokyo University of Foreign Studies. Currently, he continues to publish as a researcher of Toyo Bunko, the major center for Oriental studies and libraries in Japan. His works on *Muhsinzade Mehmet Paşa ve Ayanlık Muessesesi, 1976, Some Documents on the Big Farms of the Notables in Western Anatolia, Materials on Bosnian Notables,* all published in 1976, and more recent work on the famous notable family of Karaosmanoğulları in 1997 are considered to be definitive studies on the subject among Ottoman historians in Turkey as well. Currently retired, Professor Nagata kindly asked this author to present a paper on his recent publication on Istanbul theater to the Conference in Vienna in 2022 because he prefers not to fly these days long distances.

The second author Hikari Egawa is a younger-generation Japanese professor of Ottoman history who is working at Ochanomizu University in Tokyo. Like many Japanese specialists in Turkish and Turkic studies, she is keenly interested in the history of the nomads in Turkey which has been the subject of her original articles and works. Together with İlhan Şahin, she published a study of the Yağcı Bedir Yörükleri / Bir Yörük Grubu ve Hayat Tarzı, 2007, and recently an interesting article on the "Cemeteries and Gravestones of Nomads in Their Sedentarization Process: Focusing on the Yagci Bedir Group in Northern Western Anatolia during the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Century", Archivum Ottomanicum, 2016. The book is divided into four major parts with subdivisions. The first part covers the history of early modern Ottoman Istanbul's theater and the entry of European contemporary dramatic theater during the nineteenth century. The first part covers the building of new theater houses and the pioneering role of the Ottoman Armenians of Istanbul in creating an urban culture of theater in the city that became the foundation of modern theater in Turkey. The book discusses the career of Ottoman Armenians Güllü Agop, Mardinos Mınakyan, the first Turkish performers and theater activities. Theater was also as a political act as seen in the censorship of Namik Kemal's "Vatan yahut Silistre". The authors develop a comparative discussion of the fate of Japanese theater during the same period and the contemporary debate in Turkey among

scholars and public intellectuals about the "backward" nature of traditional theater such as Karagöz and Orta Oyunu versus the "progressive" quality of European style dramatic theater that emerged in the late Ottoman period. The authors aptly title the debate in the "search of the real Turkish theater". The second section discusses the birth of popular theater with the infusion of some Western elements into the traditional open-air innovative theatrical practice of the Middle Plays (Orta Oyunu) that transforms into Improvised entertainment and performances known as Tulûat. Nagata and Egawa agree with the eminent expert on the topic Metin And that Tuluat deserves attention as a creative local form that is similar to the *Comedia 'de l'arte* of Italy. The Japanese scholars bring a new perspective by comparing the origins of Kabuki the Japanese popular theater of the 18th century to Tulûat's origins in open-air improvised performances in Istanbul. The third section brings the novel approach of Nagata and Egawa to the center of the book through a detailed discussion of Kabuki's birth in late Tokugawa Japan which has similar traditions of song and dance, male actors who impersonate female roles like Orta Oyunu but developed its own script, playwrights, staging, and performance in closed building traditions of its own prior to the influence of Western culture. This section also provides the history of Western theater in Meiji Japan such as Shimpa Geki and Shingeki which are comparable to the European dramatic theater of Istanbul at the time. Finally, the fourth part exposes the Westernization process in Istanbul as social and economic history through the information on the theater posters which reflect leisure culture, consumption of consumer goods, restaurants, fashions, etc. The multi-cultural and multi-communal social life of the city enjoyed partaking in the newly flourishing theater-going culture of the city. Performances were especially popular during the Ramadan month of fasting providing latenight entertainment for the Turkish Muslim families of the city as well.

The book is based on 170 posters that represent cosmopolitan Istanbul's city culture and the variety of Theater performances which constitutes 9% of Metin And's calculation of 2004 plays performed between 1839-1923 in Istanbul. The Posters provide evidence for social history through analysis of the information on plays, playwrights, troupes, and performers, a summary of the plots, place of performance, building, and the official censorship stamps. The time period is the Reign of Abduhamid II 1876-1908 but also includes

plays from the Second Constitutional Period-The "Young Turk Revolution" of 1908-1912.<sup>1</sup>

The authors have also explained the conditions for the open access free use of the theater posters in research that constitutes a remarkably rich source for the social and cultural history of Istanbul. Nagata and Hikari note that the images of the theatrical posters can be used for scientific research according to the following regulations.

- It is prohibited to use the images of the theatrical posters with modifications.
- It is prohibited to use the images of theatrical posters with the objective of commercialization.

If you intend to use the images of the theatrical posters for the benefit of scientific research, you must acknowledge the source by stating that 'These theatrical posters belong to the Research Institute for Languages and Cultures of Asia and Africa (ILCAA), Tokyo University of Foreign Studies (TUFS),' including the address of the website (<a href="http://osmanlitiyatro.aa-ken.jp/">http://osmanlitiyatro.aa-ken.jp/</a>) and the number of the image (for example Al). In addition, if you quote information from the 'Table of the Theatrical Company,' please also acknowledge, 'Hikari Egawa, Table of the Theatrical Company' (2017, <a href="http://osmanlitiyatro.aa-ken.jp/">http://osmanlitiyatro.aa-ken.jp/</a>).<sup>2</sup>

For example, the poster about the performance titled Mermaid includes a canto dance and song act along with the play on Mermaids that was typical of the Şehzadebaşı neighborhood of Turkish-style performances that were popular in the Direkler Arası area in the old city.

An example of the multi-cultural and multi-lingual appeal of theater would be the performance of the play the Mystery of the Cemetery or Can a Lover be Defeated? The plays were performed in both Armenian and Turkish as the poster notes.

Another series of posters this time show us that stores and firms used the opportunity to advertise their goods to the theater-going public such as ladies' underwear, washing machines, printers, and the like.

<sup>1</sup> Nagata, pp. 13-15.

<sup>2</sup> Nagata, p. 10.

The posters enable us to have a glimpse at the lively cultural life of the city via theater that appealed both to the European residents of the city as well as the local Muslim, Christian, and Jewish communities. Among the posters, there are 48 Posters for Ramadan nights indicating the popularity of Theater performances for the general Muslim Turkish public in Istanbul, especially during the evenings after the long days of fasting. We understand that after breaking fast at sunset, the city's Muslim families liked to attend the lively plays and entertainment shows of song and dance in the old city or attend open-air performances in the gardens on the Anatolian side of Istanbul. The shows would continue late into the night. After the show, the local neighborhood pudding shops offered light meals and desserts for the theatergoers who returned home quite late to have a short rest until the early wake-up call before sunrise to have a final meal preparing for the long fasting hours during the day. The posters inform us that the theater companies who wanted to attract an audience from different neighborhoods even offered "taxi service" of special trolley car carriages that would transport the families back home late at night after the end of the show.3

According to the posters, 123 Performances included a major play as well as comedy acts and song and dance in a night of performance, and cited the names of the Troupes which produced the performance. The famous Osmanlı Tiyatrosu-Osmanlı Dram Kumpanyası had 52 performances, Hayalhane i Osmanlı Kumpanyası 52, Milli Osmanlı Tiyatrosu 8, Eğlencehane i Osmani Kumpanyası 38, Sahne i Millliyye i Osmaniyye Kumpanyası 8, and finally Handehane i Osmani Kumpanyası 7 performances. Based on the posters, the neighborhoods of the 170 Performances constituted Beyoğlu (Pera) 27, the old city of İstanbul 62, Anatolian Side 71, other sites 5, and unknown 5 sites indicating the balanced distribution of performances on the Anatolian side as well as the European part of the city that included the cosmopolitan Pera business district as well as the old city quarters.

The multi-ethnic and multi-denominational population of greater Istanbul lived in neighborhoods that usually inhabited a mixture of families from diverse religious communities. Though not separated into strictly

<sup>3</sup> Nagata, pp. 145-148

<sup>4</sup> Nagata, p. 14.

segregated communal ghettos, still some neighborhoods did have a majority of a particular community with some families from other communities who lived there as well. Muslims tended to live in the historic Istanbul part of the old city within the city walls where Topkapi Palace was located or on the Anatolian side. Recently the Ottoman elites of the nineteenth century moved closer to the European-style palaces forming the new "modern" neighborhoods of Nişantaş and Beşiktaş. On the other hand, the Ottoman non-Muslim Greek, Armenian, and Jewish communities historically lived mostly on the European side of the city, proximate to the Pera business district as well as among the villages of the two shores of the Bosphorus. In addition, there were neighborhoods linked with the historic churches or synagogues in the old city of Istanbul on the European side as well like Fener for the Greek Patriarchate neighborhood or Balat for the old Jewish quarters. In sum, the multi-religious and multi-cultural/ethnically mixed population of greater Istanbul, historic Konstantiniye was distributed all over the city and the neighborhood distribution of the posters were usually multi-lingual as seen above with Turkish, French, Armenian, or Greek explanations of the play titles –location addresses- troupe company names. The posters shows that theater appealed to all communities.

Nagata and Egawa categorize the types of Istanbul Theater Performances between those more faithful to enacting European plays versus those with more local entertainment genres perhaps derived from the old Middle Play open-air performance tradition of the city. The Dramatic Theater of the Palace and the Pera district were based on European Plays that were performed by the famous Palace Theater of Güllü Agop (1840-1902) the Ottoman Armenian founder of the Istanbul City Theaters, İstanbul Şehir Tiyatroları who is recognized as the pioneer of the modern theater of Turkey. The posters also cite the Ottoman Drama Troupe of Mardinos Mınakyan (1839-1920) who had

<sup>5</sup> Metin And, Osmanlı tiyatrosu, kuruluşu, gelişimi, katkısı (Ottoman theater, its foundation, development and contributions) İstanbul: AÜ Dil ve Tarih Coğrafya Fakültesi 1999 among his prolific publications on the subject; Ozgecan Karadagli, (2017). "From Empire to Republic: Western Art Music, Nationalism, and the Merging Mediation of Saygun's Op. 26 Yunus Emre Oratorio", Ph.D. Dissertation). University of Alberta. p. 42; Palmira Johnson Brummett, Image and Imperialism in the Ottoman Revolutionary Press, 1908-1911, Binghamton, SUNY Press, 2000, p. 404. Having converted to Islam, he is the father of Necip Yakup Aşkın, considered as one of the most prominent violin masters Turkey produced and his grandson, Yücel Aşkın, was the rector of Van's Yüzüncü Yıl University.

joined Güllü Agop's troupe initially and later established his own company which became significant in the last years of the Ottoman empire. Mınakyan is considered to be the mentor and trainer of Turkish performers who is credited for having single-handedly served the foundation of the twentieth-century Theater of Turkey. The dramatic theater performances were in step with Western-style theater with script and staging. They were mostly performed in the Pera district in the European part of Istanbul. These plays addressed a cosmopolitan audience that included local highly educated elite Ottoman Turks, Non-Muslims, Europeans, and even a Japanese merchant!

On the other hand, Tulûat, or Improvised Theater, acted frequently in the open-air too in parks and gardens of the Anatolian side for the general public adapting traditional theater's emotional aspect and improvised acting. Improvised Theater was criticized by European-educated elites as backward and in desperate need of reform and or replacement by European theater. But like Metin And, Nagata argues that Tulûat was an important local transformation of the traditional Middle Pay, Orta Oyunu open-air performances that subsequently adopted Western practices such as the stage, basic script, curtain, and Halls. Combined song, dance, and entertainment to compete with European-style theater.

Nagata explains to us the background of the 16<sup>th</sup>-century Turkish traditional Theater of Karagöz Shadow Plays and Orta Oyunu Open Air improvised theater that he argues came from the Far East. Originally from the Far East, these popular forms of entertainment are thought to have arrived via the Indian Ocean and Egypt. An ancient East Asian form of theater, the shadow play became the traditional form of nomad army entertainment culture in the steppes that entered with the Mongols and later to South East Asia (today's Indonesia. The shadow plays of East Asia came to the Near East during the Mongol empire in the 13<sup>th</sup> century first through the acceleration of trade, then with the Ottoman conquest of Egypt during the 16<sup>th</sup> Century the art arrived in Istanbul.<sup>6</sup>

Nagata's comparative perspective frames his study as part of global history, as he argues that the 16<sup>th</sup> century is the "Golden Age" of popular theater globally. He notes that Commedia dell' Arte in Italy, Shakespeare theater in

<sup>6</sup> Nagata, pp. 19-28.

England, Kabuki in Japan, Karagöz, and Orta Oyunu in Istanbul reflect the popular culture in an urban setting for the "commoner" population. Following Metin And, Nagata argues that Orta Oyunu's traditional improvised open-air theater is similar to modern "anti-theater". Nagata also links "anti-theater" to the revival of early modern "Jester" theater in modern form.<sup>7</sup>

The work's originality stems from Nagata's particular comparison of Turkish theater's history and evolution to that of Japanese theater which enlarges the usual "East-West" binary approach to compare and contrast Western phenomena with that of the "Non-West". Nagata finds Orta Oyunu comparable to Manzai and Puppet theater in early modern Japan during the feudal order of the Tokugawa Shogunate. Early Japanese performances of the early 17th century like Orta Oyunu, and Manzai were open-air early Japanese performances of dance, song, and jesters. Japanese theater also developed the tradition of female impersonation of women by male performers known as Onna gata "Female form" like Zenne of Orta Oyunu. The tradition still continues in traditional theater performances in Japan such as the classical theater of Noh and the traditional popular theater of Kabuki. Rakugo was like the Meddah of the traditional Ottoman theater of jesters.<sup>8</sup>

But early Japanese open-air theater Manzai is thought to have lost some aspects and became the origins of later transformation in the 18<sup>th</sup> century of *Kabuki* popular theater with famous playwrights who wrote scripts, and performed on a stage-like Shakespearean theater's transition. Kabuki did keep some old traditions like *onna gata*, music, and dance. On the other hand, Nagata argues that Ottoman Orta Oyunu remained faithful to the old openair tradition that was lost in Japan and survived into the nineteenth century when the tradition encountered the cultural currents from Europe.<sup>9</sup>

Unlike the familiar critic of Western-oriented elites in Turkey who once had considered Orta Oyunu as "backward", the Nagata-Egawa Perspective emphasizes the integration of traditional forms into the fusion of Modern Theater rather than negatively discarding them as "backward": They focus on Tulûat in particular for their argument. When Western theater entered the Ottoman world Orta Oyunu and Karagöz forms and tastes adopted the stage,

<sup>7</sup> İbid.

<sup>8</sup> Ibid.

<sup>9</sup> Nagata., pp. 115-127 for Kabuki and Western theater.

curtain, and elements from Europe and formed Tulûat, a new improvised theater with song, dance-Kanto (Italian Canto), with plays that appealed to the emotive entertainment interest of the general Istanbul public. While the Western dramatic performances appealed to the European-educated Ottoman Turks, the Foreign community of business, diplomats, travelers, and Ottoman Armenian and Greek elites, the Istanbul general public liked Tulûat improvised theater. Thus even though, Ottoman elites and later modern Turks sometimes "disliked" tulûat as simply crude entertainment and advocated scripts, staging for plays like in European drama to disseminate high moral and patriotic vision, though all faced closures and censorship. For example, Namık Kemal's famous "Fatherland or Silistre" caused a high commotion that led to its closure and his exile. The career of Naşit Bey of the Tulûat form represents the transformation of Orta Oyunu with European theater's stage, script, and curtain. His children Selim and the famous actress Adile Naşit have continued the Tulûat form tradition.<sup>10</sup>

Nagata and Egawa offer an original comparative narrative of gazing at the Western Theater Experimentation in Meiji Japan 1868-1912 and drawing similarities and differences with the Ottoman Experience. The Meiji years between 1868 and 1912 experienced the strong impact of Westernization as the means for the adoption of "contemporary civilization" and "progressive" arts that was like the Tanzimat/Reorganization period of Ottoman Reformism in some respects. Indeed, like the Ottoman elite vision, the theater was part of Meiji Japan's vision to be "like the West" for survival and defend against Western imperialism by Westernizing Japan. Although both Ottoman Turkish and Meiji Japanese people had to survive under the cultural contradictions between "east and west" or "tradition and modernity" during the era of reform, in the case of Japan, the end result for the theater world was different. Unlike Istanbul's traditional theater, in Japan, Kabuki, the popular theater tradition of the early modern Tokugawa era, successfully resisted immersion into the Western theater's form. This was possible because Kabuki, the traditional popular theater of the 18th century had already developed a culture of famous families of theater players, stage, script, famous playwrights (Chikamatsu Monzaemon), and performances in a closed building. While the modern

<sup>10</sup> Nagata, pp. 59-61 for traditional theater and criticism.

Japanese of the Meiji period, experimented by establishing Shin-Kabuki (New Kabuki) adapting "natural acting", female actresses, and themes of everyday life, somehow Westernizing the traditional form fizzled off. Consequently, Kabuki "fought back" with success continuing its popularity to this day, but adopted a few elements from the Western tradition like lighting and seating in chairs instead of candles, and sitting Japanese style on tatami straw mats. The traditional actor family lineages continue to this day to train performers according to Kabuki tradition and Kabuki actors have fans just like Western cinema or theater. The tradition of acting strictly follows the Kabuki method that is visible in the striking makeup of the actors and the unique dramatic dance-like gestures of acting such as in the famous Mie 見え-form when the actor makes a striking pose with a dramatic grimace and stands absolutely still -the charisma of the Moment for the audience.

Like in Istanbul, however, the Meiji era new Theater that was based on European dramatic performances and Western plays-Shimpa Geki (New Wave Theater), and Shingeki (New Theater) expanded as a major theater form to this day. Today Kabuki and Western style Modern Theater co-exist separately.<sup>11</sup>

In some respects, the theater comparison between Ottoman Istanbul and Meiji Japan represents the divergent patterns of adopting Western cultural forms in both societies during the same period of reform. The Japanese reformists tended to form a modern Japanese identity by separating and constructing the traditional Japanese forms as "pure Japanese" that coexisted with the Western forms suitable for a modern individual defined as "pure European. For example, wearing the kimono in suitable times coexisted with a Western dress that the same individual wore as required by the situation. Hence, while the Meiji ideological claim was for "eastern/Japanese morality and Western science as method", in reality, the Japanese men and women developed a "dual identity" of the separate but equal concept of the traditional Japanese form and that of the Western one. The pattern exhibited the pragmatic and situational logic of the modern Japanese individual. On

<sup>11</sup> Nagata, pp. 115-127.

<sup>12</sup> Selçuk Esenbel "The Anguish of Civilization: Western Cultural Forms in the Everyday Lives of the Meiji Japanese and the Ottoman Turks During the Nineteenth Century," *Japan Review*, 1994, No. 5: 145-85; Selçuk Esenbel "Medeni Davranışın Aczi-I, II, Batı kültür formlarının 19. yüzyılda

the other hand, the Ottoman Turks adopted Western forms in their personal lives liberally while developing a public sphere that modified Western cultural forms in line with traditional Islamic norms. For example, Muslim women in Istanbul started wearing an adaptation of Western-style dress at home but wore a veil designed for the public sphere, or Ottoman men adopted the Western-style uniform and everyday male attire but mixed it with the Fes headgear to distinguish the dynastic identity in a reform context. In other words, Turks "liked" mixing the two "tradition" and the Western into one single hybrid whole. Needless to say, the divergence in the patterns of adopting Western cultural forms for the sake of being in step with the nineteenth-century "civilizing process" in line with Norbert Elias's argument for the civilizing process of cultural change that had occurred in Europe is beyond the interest this book review, but the Kabuki versus Tulûat model of Nagata-Egawa happens to fit very well into this author's argument back in 1995 on the civilizing process patterns of the modern individual in Japan and Turkey.

In sum, the Nagata-Egawa work offers the following conclusions. Western European Theater's entry into Ottoman Istanbul was much earlier than Japan's. Here the difference in geography, history, and cultural interaction has influenced the way in which Western culture was adapted in each case. The Ottomans obviously being part of the Mediterranean encountered the Italian tradition of Commedia Dell' Arte very early that already had integrated with the Middle Play form. Again unlike Japan which constituted primarily of a population that shared the same language, and religious culture with a minimal number of "minority" populations, the multicultural and multi-religious population of the Ottoman empire enabled the Ottoman Christian-Armenian community pioneer the introduction of Western theater and integrate with the Turkish performers and Ottoman elite bureaucrats and writers in Ottoman cosmopolitanism. A speculative thought would be if the Tokugawa government had not harshly banned Christianity during the early 17th century, forcing the visible minority of Japanese Christians

Meiji Japonlarının ve Osmanlı Türklerinin gündelik yaşamlarında kullanımı" (The Anguish of Civilized Behavior I and II The everyday use of western cultural forms by the Meiji Japanese and the Ottoman Turks during the nineteenth century), *Toplumsal Tarih*, No. 47 November, pp. 6-14 for part I, No. 48 December, pp. 715 for part II, 1997.

who had converted during the 16<sup>th</sup> century expansion of Catholic missions in Asia to give up their faith or fearfully go underground, perhaps the Japanese Christians might have acted as the windows to European culture much earlier in Japan as well. But the Tokugawa authorities who were very nervous about the entry of the Spanish empire next door with the conquest of the Philippines, banned Christianity fearing that the Japanese Christians might be loyal to the global Catholic Papacy in the event of a clash with Spain. Finally, unlike Japan's Kabuki that "resists" radical change, traditional Turkish Theater thus transformed itself into *Tulûat*, a new form by adopting some elements of Western theater-script, stage, and closed theater building, but kept its improvisation tradition embedded in the new form.

According to Nagata, Istanbul becomes a Theater city like Tokyo, London, and Paris and was part of Westernization like other cities globally. The introduction of gas lamps and later post-1908 electrification were somewhat later in Istanbul compared to Tokyo which was electrified quite early. Nagata comments on the controversial role of Tahir bey who collaborated with the Censorship authorities for which he was criticized, but also became a major impresario of the theater world. Nagata's economic history background has led him to analyze the poster stamps which he argues created revenue that contributed to the payment of the Ottoman Debt.<sup>13</sup> The posters also provide a window into the new commercial life-taste-European style stores that sold import products-fashionable dresses, shoes, Singer machines, etc. The Istanbul public including the Muslim elites enthusiastically adopted the European "bourgeois" culture of cafes, pastry shops, and restaurants especially in performances geared for enlivening the Ramadan nights.

The Euro-Turkish and Euro-Japanese interaction theater surfaces as a local cultural transfer that represents the multi-faceted dynamics of Westernization beyond Europe as a global history. The process is embedded in the gestation of local "national" cultural identities in many geographies. The Nagata-Egawa book opens a window into understanding this process via their original study of Istanbul theater from a Japanese perspective.

<sup>13</sup> Nagata, p. 165.

### References

- And, Metin. Osmanlı tiyatrosu, kuruluşu, gelişimi, katkısı (Ottoman theater, its foundation, development and contributions) İstanbul: AÜ Dil ve Tarih Coğrafya Fakültesi 1999.
- Brummett, Palmira Johnson. *Image and Imperialism in the Ottoman Revolutionary Press*, 1908-1911, Binghamton, SUNY Press, 2000,
- Çamurdan, Esen, et.al., the new exhibition catalog, *Kulis Bir Tiyatro Belleği*, *Hagop Ayvaz*, İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 2021.
- Esenbel, Selçuk. "The Anguish of Civilization: Western Cultural Forms in the Everyday Lives of the Meiji Japanese and the Ottoman Turks During the Nineteenth Century," *Japan Review*, 1994, No. 5: 145-85.
- Esenbel, Selçuk. "Medeni Davranışın Aczi-I, II, Batı kültür formlarının 19. yüzyılda Meiji Japonlarının ve Osmanlı Türklerinin gündelik yaşamlarında kullanımı" (The Anguish of Civilized Behavior I and II The everyday use of western cultural forms by the Meiji Japanese and the Ottoman Turks during the nineteenth century), *Toplumsal Tarih*, No. 47 November pp. 6-14 for part I, No. 48 December p. 715 for part II, 1997.
- Yuzo Nagata and Hikari Egawa. *Bir Kentin Toplumsal Tarihi Açısından Osmanlı'nın Son Döneminde İstanbul'da Tiyatro ve Çevresi*, İstanbul: Dergah Yayınları, 2021.